

State Board of Education Education Quality Standards Rule Committee

Draft Meeting Minutes

Meeting Place: Virtual Teams Meeting/Video/Teleconference
Call in #: 1-802-828-7667, Conference ID: 658 939 579#

Date: August 11, 2022

Present:

State Board of Education (SBE) Subcommittee Members: Kim Gleason (chair), Patrick Brown, Tom Lovett, Gabrielle Lucci

Others: Mark Hage; Karen Heidi Fishman; Yoram Samets; Alyssa Chen

Call to Order, Introductions, Approve Draft Minutes from July 28, 2022

Kim Gleason called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. The approval of minutes was tabled.

Public to be Heard

The Committee heard from Karen Heidi Fishman and Yoram Samets. Ms Fishman and Mr. Samets urged the Committee to retain the phrase “groups that have historically been subject to persecution or genocide” in the definition of Ethnic Groups. Mr. Samets also urged the committee to consider the difference between Liberate Ethnic Studies and Inclusive Ethnic Studies.

Committee consideration of feedback received regarding definitions discussed at the June 30, 2022 meeting

The Committee reviewed the revised definition of “Ethnic Studies” which placed the phrase “those who have historically been subject to persecution or genocide” at the end of the first sentence, created a second sentence that defined the kind of study to be undertaken, and revised the third sentence that expended the definition to include the lenses of social identity groups. The Committee discussed dropping the word “critical” from the definition, adding other specific groups to the list of social identity groups, and adding the term “social identity groups” to the definition’s last sentence. This last revision would also involve moving the specific list of groups to the definition of Social Identity Groups and adding the phrase “and others”.

Mr. Hage explained the expansion of the definition of Ethnic Studies to include social identity groups is common in the current scholarship in this area. He also explained that the rationale for including the specific list of social identity groups was to make sure that people in those groups felt as if the document

specifically recognized their lenses. The Committee then discussed the need to balance the desire for specificity and the desire for inclusiveness and clarity in the definitions.

The Committee also discussed the use of the words “critical” and “critically” in the document and the desire to separate these terms from the politically charged uses in current discourse about “critical race theory”. The Act 1 Working Group and Tom Lovett will gather definitions of the terms as commonly used by educators.

Committee consideration of remaining definitions

The Committee looked over the remaining definitions to see if others needed clarification or revision, and none were identified. Chair Gleason acknowledged that there were other areas of the document that needed to be discussed, including the question of to whom the document would apply. She expressed that this question would most likely require a legal opinion separate from the AOE.

Future Agenda Items

The Committee discussed other future agenda items, including input from practitioners in the field who would be responsible for operationalizing the standards. Some groups identified were curriculum directors, equity directors, special education directors, principals, superintendents, and school board members. Other stakeholders such as students and the AOE would be consulted as well.

The Committee discussed its upcoming meeting schedule and changed the time of its August 25 meeting to 11:00 a.m. - 12:30 p.m. Other meetings will be scheduled through a Doodle poll, and the committee will try to keep its every-other-Thursday schedule, recognizing that the school year is starting and not every member may be able to attend each meeting.

Public to be Heard

The Committee heard from Alyssa Chen and Karen Heidi Fishman. Ms. Chen offered a list of stakeholders who would be helpful to the committee. She also asked when the committee would hold its listening sessions, originally slated for late September. Chair Gleason explained that this listening session, which is different than the formal public hearing process in rulemaking, may have to be pushed to October, given the pace of the committee’s work.

Ms. Fishman requested that the phrase “or genocide” be added to the very end of the definition of Ethnic Group, pointing out that it would complete the continuum from discrimination to exclusion to genocide. Ms. Chen stated that she felt that further specification of groups was unnecessary and could get unwieldy.

Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 11:36 a.m.

Minutes prepared by Tom Lovett,